

A Brief Introduction to Semantic Web – and a Contribution to Explainable Artificial Intelligence

Pascal Hitzler

Data Semantics Laboratory (DaSe Lab) Data Science and Security Cluster (DSSC) Wright State University http://www.pascal-hitzler.de





Textbook

Pascal Hitzler, Markus Krötzsch, Sebastian Rudolph

Foundations of Semantic Web Technologies

Chapman & Hall/CRC, 2010

Choice Magazine Outstanding Academic Title 2010 (one out of seven in Information & Computer Science)



Foundations of Semantic Web Technologies

CHARMAN & HALL/CRC TOTROCKS IN COMPLETING

> Pascal Hitzler Markus Krötzsch Sebastian Rudolph

CRC Press classification

http://www.semantic-web-book.org



Semantic Web journal

- EiCs: Pascal Hitzler Krzysztof Janowicz
- Funded 2010

WRIGHT STATE

- 2017 Impact factor of 2.889, top (with 1.3 distance) of all journals with "Web" in the title
- We very much welcome contributions at the "rim" of traditional Semantic Web research – e.g., work which is strongly inspired by a different field.
- Non-standard (open & transparent) review process.



http://www.semantic-web-journal.net/



Confirmed speakers/panelists/coordinators:

Achille Fukoue Karl Grossner Jim Hendler Chris Mungall Chaitan Baru Dan Brickley David Booth

Tim Finin Peter Fox Michael Grüninger Melissa Haendel Eric Kansa Craig Knoblock Werner Kuhn Matt Lange Rob Sanderson Philip Schreur Ryan Shaw Brian Ulicny

Program Chair: Krzysztof Janowicz





November 2017 – UCSB – Pascal Hitzler

WRIGHT



"Expert Systems" traditionally based on the logic programming paradigm.

In the wake of Semantic Web Technologies, Description Logics have emerged as alternative dominant paradigm.

Description logics underlie the W3C standard "Web Ontology Language" (OWL).





Semantic Web technologies provides efficient methods for

data sharing data reuse data integration data discovery for all kinds of application scenarios.

Key idea: A good data model (schema) makes a lot of a difference!



Description Logics

- Unary and binary predicates only (classes = concepts properties = roles)
- Conjunction, disjunction, negation and restricted quantifiers to form complex class expressions
- SubClass relationships (i.e., implications between complex classes)
- Role chains (concatenation of binary predicates)
- Variable bindings are severely restricted.

Result:

- Decidable logics, with complexities known.
- Variable-free notation.
- Some are P-complete; some are 2NExpTime
- Very efficient reasoners available.

Semantic Data Models

W



	AgentRole \sqsubseteq (=1 performedBy.Agent) $\sqcap \forall$ performedBy.Agent	(10.1)
	$\exists performedBy.Agent \sqsubseteq AgentRole$	(10.2)
	$\top \sqsubseteq \forall pAR.AgentRole$	(10.3)
	ChessGame $\sqsubseteq \exists atPlace.Place \sqcap \forall atPlace.Place$	(10.4)
	ChessGame ⊑ ∃atTime.xsd:dateTime □ ∀atTime.xsd:dateTime	(10.5)
	ChessGame ⊑ ∃pAR.BlackPlayerRole ⊓ ∃pAR.WhitePlayerRole	(10.6)
	$\exists subEventOf.ChessTournament \sqcup \exists hasOpening.ChessOpening \sqsubseteq ChessGame$	(10.7)
	\exists hasResult.ChessGameResult $\sqcup \exists$ hasReport.ChessGameReport \sqsubseteq ChessGame	(10.8)
	$ChessGame \sqsubseteq \forall subEventOf.ChessTournament \sqcap \forall hasOpening.ChessOpening$	(10.9)
	$ChessGame \sqsubseteq \forall hasResult.ChessGameResult \sqcap \forall hasReport.ChessGameReport$	(10.10)
	$BlackPlayerRole \sqcup WhitePlayerRole \sqsubseteq AgentRole \sqcap (=1 \ pAR^ChessGame)$	(10.11)
	$ChessGame \sqsubseteq (=1 hasFirstHalfMove.HalfMove) \sqcap (=1 hasLastHalfMove.HalfMove)$	(10.12)
	$ChessGame \sqsubseteq (=1 hasLastHalfMove.HalfMove)$	(10.13)
	$hasHalfMove \sqsubseteq subEventOf^-$	(10.14)
	$hasFirstHalfMove \sqsubseteq hasHalfMove$	(10.15)
	$hasLastHalfMove \sqsubseteq hasHalfMove$	(10.16)
	$HalfMove \sqsubseteq Event \sqcap \exists pAR. ActingPlayerRole \sqcap (=1 hasHalfMove^ ChessGame)$	(10.17)
	$ActingPlayerRole \sqsubseteq AgentRole \sqcap (=1 \ pAR^HalfMove)$	(10.18)
	$HalfMove \sqsubseteq (\leq 1 nextHalfMove.HalfMove) \sqcap \neg \exists nextHalfMove.Self$	(10.19)
I	$\exists subEventOf.ChessGame \sqcup \exists nextHalfMove.HalfMove \sqsubseteq HalfMove$	(10.20)
Wi	$\exists has SANRecord.xsd:string \sqsubseteq HalfMove$	(10.21)
U	HalfMove 🗆 🗸 SubEventOf ChessGame 🗆 VnextHalfMove HalfMove	$(10.22)^{0}$

Ontology and Knowledge Graph



RDF uses Web-referencable identifiers.

E.g., :ag422yt6 expands to a full URI (for Magnus Carlsen). Under best practices, it even dereferences.



Ontologies & Knowledge Graphs

Knowledge Graph

RDF Graph

Labelled Directed Graph

Abox

Facts

Schema

Ontology

Type Logic

Tbox

Logical Theory



November 2017 – UCSB – Pascal Hitzler



Theresa May

British Prime Minister



tmay.co.uk

Theresa Mary May is a British politician who has served as Prime Minister of the United Kingdom and Leader of the Conservative Party since July 2016, the second woman to hold both positions. Wikipedia

Born: October 1, 1956 (age 60), Eastbourne, United Kingdom

Height: 5' 8"

Party: Conservative Partv

Spouse: Philip May (m. 1980)

Education: St Hugh's College, Oxford (1974 - 1977)

Previous offices: Home Secretary (2010-2016), MORE ~

Profiles

W



People also search for View 15+



St Hugh's College, Oxford *

Website

College in Oxford. England

Directions

St Hugh's College is one of the constituent colleges of the University of Oxford, It is located on a 14.5-acre site on St Margaret's Road, to the north of the city centre. Wikipedia

Address: St Margaret's Rd, Oxford OX2 6LE, UK

Principal: Elish Angiolini Phone: +44 1865 274900 Founder: Elizabeth Wordsworth Founded: 1886 Named for: Hugh of Lincoln

Undergraduates: 432 (2011-2012)

Suggest an edit · Own this business?

Reviews from the web

4.1/5 University Rooms · 2,310 votes

Send to your phone

Send

Notable alumni

View 40+



Theresa

Mav







<

Hugh of Lincoln

Saint

Hugh of Lincoln, also known as Hugh of Avalon, was a French noble, Benedictine and Carthusian monk, bishop of Lincoln in the Kingdom of England, and Catholic saint. Wikipedia

Born: 1140, Avalon, France

Died: November 16, 1200, London, United Kinadom

Feast: 16 November (R.C.C.): 17 November (Anglican)

Major shrine: Lincoln Cathedral

Attributes: a white swan

Patronage: sick children, sick people, shoemakers and swans

Thomas

More

People also search for



Little Saint

Huah of

Lincoln



William Howard. 1st Visco

- Pasca

D



Suu Kvi

Barbara

Castle

Schema.org

- Collaboratively launched in 2011 by Google, • Microsoft, Yahoo, Yandex. 2011: 297 classes, 187 relations 2015: 638 classes, 965 relations
- Simple schema, request to web site providers to • annotate their content with schema.org markup. Promise: They will make better searches based on this.
- 2015: 31.3% of Web pages have schema.org \bullet markup, on average 26 assertions per page.

Ramanathan V. Guha, Dan Brickley, Steve Macbeth: Schema.org: Evolution of Structured Data on the Web. ACM Queue 13(9): 10 (2015)







 TrainTrip Organization

- Airline
 - Corporation
 - EducationalOrganization
 - CollegeOrUniversity
 - ElementarySchool
 - HighSchool
 - MiddleSchool
 - Preschool
 - School
- GovernmentOrganization
- LocalBusiness
 - AnimalShelter
 - AutomotiveBusiness
 - AutoBodyShop
 - AutoDealer
 - AutoPartsStore
 - AutoRental
 - AutoRepair
 - AutoWash
 - GasStation
 - MotorcycleDealer
 - MotorcycleRepair
 - ChildCare
 - Dentist
 - DryCleaningOrLaundry EmergencyService
 - FireStation
 - Hospital
 - PoliceStation
 - EmploymentAgency
 - EntertainmentBusiness
 - AdultEntertainment
 - AmusementPark
 - ArtGallery
 - Casino
 - ComedyClub
 - MovieTheater
 - NightClub
 - FinancialService
 - AccountingService AutomatedTeller
 - **BankOrCreditUnion**
 - InsuranceAgency
 - FoodEstablishment
 - Bakery
 - BarOrPub
 - Brewery
 - CafeOrCoffeeShop
 - FastFoodRestaurant



Main page Community portal Project chat Create a new item Recent changes Random item Query Service Nearby Help Donate

Print/export

Create a book Download as PDF Printable version

In other projects

Wikimedia Commons MediaWiki Meta-Wiki Wikispecies Wikibooks Wikinews Wikipedia Wikiguote Wikisource Wikiversity Wikivoyage Wiktionary

Tools

What links here

Search Wikidata Q Read View source View history Main Page Discussion collaborative api Welcome to Wikidata the free knowledge base with 29,012,184 data items that anyone can edit multilingua Introduction • Project Chat • Community Portal • Help free

Welcome!

Wikidata is a free and open knowledge base that can be read and edited by both humans and machines.

Wikidata acts as central storage for the **structured data** of its Wikimedia sister projects including Wikipedia, Wikivoyage, Wikisource, and others.

Wikidata also provides support to many other sites and services beyond just Wikimedia projects! The content of Wikidata is available under a free license , exported using standard formats, and can be interlinked to other open data sets on the linked data web.

Learn about data

New to the wonderful world of data? Develop and improve your data literacy through content designed to get you up to speed and feeling comfortable with the fundamentals in no time.





Linked Data

A bit older but somewhat more expressive: Linked Data on the W

Number of Datasets

...

2017-01-26	1,146
2014-08-30	570
2011-09-19	295
2010-09-22	203
2009-07-14	95
2008-09-18	45
2007-10-08	25
2007-05-01	12
38.606.40	8.85

8 5 4 triples and counting!

DaSe Lab

LOD Laundromat

DBpedia: LOTR page



UNIVERSITY	November 2017 – UCSB – Pascal Hitzler	
dcterms:subject	 category:Monomyths category:High_fantasy_novels category:Middle-earth_books category:British_fantasy_novels category:Fantasy_books_by_series category:1950s_fantasy_novels category:Sequel_novels category:The_Lord_of_the_Rings category:English_novels 	
dbpprop:wikiPageUsesTemplate	 dbpedia:Template:Infobox_book_series dbpedia:Template:Pp-vandalism actorserrubter 	
dbpprop:small	■ yes	
dbpprop:publisher	dbpedia:Allen_&_Unwin	
dbpprop:pubDate	 21 (xsd:integer) 	
dbpprop:precededBy	 dbpedia:The_Hobbit 	
dbpprop:pages	 1216 (xsd:integer) 	
dbpprop:name	The Lord of the Rings	
dbpprop:mediaType	Print	
dbpprop:language	 English 	
dbpprop:imageCaption	 Tolkien's own cover designs for the three volumes 	
dbpprop:hasPhotoCollection	 http://www4.wiwiss.fu-berlin.de/flickrwrappr/photos/The_Lord_of_the_Rings 	
dbpprop:genre	 dbpedia:Adventure_novel dbpedia:High_fantasy 	
dbpprop:expiry	 20 (xsd:integer) 	
dbpprop:country	 England 	
dbpprop: books	 dbpedia:The_Two_Towers dbpedia:The_Return_of_the_King dbpedia:The_Fellowship_of_the_Ring Volumes:" 	
dbpprop:author	dbpedia:JRRTolkien	
dbpedia-owl:wikiPageExternalLink	 http://lotr.wikia.com http://www.glyphweb.com/arda/ http://www.tolkienlibrary.com/ http://www.tolkien.co.uk/ http://www.houghtonmifflinbooks.com/features/lordoftheringstrilogy/ 	-0P8
dbpedia-owl:thumbnail	http://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/thumb/6/62/Jrrt_lotr_cover_design.jpg/200px-Jrrt_lotr_cover_design	n.jpg

Linked Data: Volume

DaSe Lab

Geoindexed Linked Data – courtesy of Krzysztof Janowicz, 2012 http://stko.geog.ucsb.edu/location_linked_data



Some Linked Datasets 2017

Legend

Cross Domain Publications Networking ncomina Links Outgoing Links

Linking Open Data cloud diagram 2017, by Andrejs Abele, John P. McCrae, Paul Buitelaar, Anja Jentzsch and Richard Cyganiak. http://lod-cloud.net/

Cyganiak. http://lod-cloud.r

WRIGHT



Data *management*: SWT promises:

If information is structured *well*, then this significantly reduces data management cost (discovery, reuse, repurposing, integration, revision).

Use of standards.

Best practices.

Data and ontology quality principles.







November 2017 – UCSB – Pascal Hitzler



Semantic Web Technologies simplify the data curation part.

- Easier integration of different sources.
- Clearer relationship between data organization and expert knowledge (i.e., data easier to understand).
- Easier discovery of relevant data.



TE

WR



Joint work with

Md Kamruzzaman Sarker, Derek Doran, Ning Xie, Mike Raymer



DL Extraction from ANNs

- Explain input-output behavior of trained (deep) NNs.
- Idea:
 - Use background knowledge in the form of linked data and ontologies to help explain.
 - Link inputs and outputs to background knowledge.
 - Use a symbolic learning system (e.g., DL-Learner) to generate an explanatory theory.

• We're just starting on this, I report on very first experiments.



DL Extraction from ANNs

WR



November 2017 – UCSB – Pascal Hitzler

DL-Learner

Approach similar to inductive logic programming, but using Description Logics (the logic underlying OWL).

Positive examples:

negative examples:



- ᠈ᢩ᠐᠋᠆ᢣᢩᢩᠵ᠆ᢩ᠘ᢩ᠘ᢩ᠘
- ᠈**᠂┎╤┰╌ᢩᢙ᠆ᡶᢩᢩ᠐ᢩ᠆ᠮᢩᡛ᠆ᡱ**
- ·└⊑┟╱╗┟┻╝╲ݵ╱╶┇╴╖
- ▖ᢩᢩᢩᠣᢩ᠊᠊ᢩᡄᢩᠴᢩ᠂ᢩ᠘ᢩ᠆ᡛᢩ

- ᠈᠂ᢅᡁ᠁᠁ᢇᢩ᠘ᢩ᠘᠘ᢩ᠘᠘
- ᠈᠂ᡁ᠘᠆ᡗᢩ᠋ᡦ᠋ᠴ᠋

ι.

- ᠈ᢩᢧ᠆ᡶᢩᡄᡰ᠊ᡛᢆ᠋ᢟᢩᢖ᠆ᢣᢩᢧ᠆ᡛᡛ᠊ᡱ
- ₅ <u>Loot</u>lot

Task: find a class description (logical formula) which separates positive and negative examples.

)aSe Lab

DL-Learner

Positive examples:

- ▖▐ਰᢪᡰᠮᡱᡀᡂᡀᡛᠼ
- ᠈ᢩᡂ᠆ᢣᢩᠳ᠆ᡶᢩᢩᢘ᠆ᢩᡌ
- ᠈᠂┎᠊ᢦ᠋ᢆᢖ᠆ᡘᢩᢩᢙᢣᡶᢩᢩ᠐ᡱᡰ᠊ᢆᡛᡱ᠊ᡱ
- ▖ﻟ਼⊒⊦۞᠊ᡰᢩݠ<u></u>ᡰ᠂ᢩᡧ᠆ᡛᡛ᠋ᢩ
- ᠈ᢩᢩᢩᡋ᠆ᢩᡄᢩᢩᠴ᠂ᢩᡰᢩᢩᢩᢩᢣ

negative examples:

- ▖▐ᄛᡨ᠊᠖ᢆᡂᢤ
- ᠈᠂ᢅᡎ᠁ᢇᡶᢩ᠘ᢣᡶᢩ᠘ᢩᡰ᠆ᡛᢩ
- ᠈᠂ᡁ᠘᠆ᢏ══┚᠆ᡛᡛ᠆ᡱ
- · \♀∕-↓⊒-↓Ţ══╤┝-\♀∕-▐▋=ੈ
- י נססאפא**ני**א

DL-Learner result: ∃hasCar.(Closed □ Short)

In FOL:

 $\{x \mid \exists y(\operatorname{hasCar}(x, y) \land \operatorname{Closed}(y) \land \operatorname{Short}(y))\}$



November 2017 – UCSB – Pascal Hitzler

DL-Learner

DL-Learner uses refinement operators to construct ever better approximations of a solution.





• Loohoh

 \top Train – covers all examples. $\exists hasCar. \top$ $\exists hasCar. Closed – covers all positives, two negatives$ $\exists hasCar(Closed \sqcap Short) - solution$



Proof of Concept Experiment



Negative:



DaSe Lab



Images

Come from the MIT ADE20k dataset <u>http://groups.csail.mit.edu/vision/datasets/ADE20K/</u> They come with annotations of objects in the picture:

001 # 0 # 0 # sky # sky # ""
002 # 0 # 0 # road, route # road # ""
005 # 0 # 0 # sidewalk, pavement # sidewalk # ""
006 # 0 # 0 # building, edifice # building # ""
007 # 0 # 0 # truck, motortruck # truck # ""
008 # 0 # 0 # hovel, hut, hutch, shack, shanty # hut # ""
009 # 0 # 0 # pallet # pallet # ""
001 # 1 # 0 # door # door # ""
002 # 1 # 0 # window # window # ""





Mapping to SUMO

Simple approach: for each known object in image, create an individual for the ontology which is in the appropriate SUMO class:

contains road1 contains window1 contains door1 contains wheel1 contains sidewalk1 contains truck1 contains box1 contains building1





November 2017 – UCSB – Pascal Hitzler

SUMO

- Suggested Merged Upper Ontology
 <u>http://www.adampease.org/OP/</u>
- Approx. 25,000 common terms covering a wide range of domains
- Centrally, a relatively naïve class hierarchy.
- Objects in image annotations became individuals (constants), which were then typed using SUMO classes.



Positive:

- img1: road, window, door, wheel, sidewalk, truck, box, building
- img2: tree, road, window, timber, building, lumber
- img3: hand, sidewalk, clock, steps, door, face, building, window, road

Negative:

- img4: shelf, ceiling, floor
- img5: box, floor, wall, ceiling, product
- img6: ceiling, wall, shelf, floor, product

DL-Learner results include:

∃contains.Transitway ∃contains.LandArea



November 2017 – UCSB – Pascal Hitzler

Proof of Concept Experiment

Contract Selection Contracts Selectico Contracts Selectico Contracts Selectico Contrac



Negative:









 $\exists contains. Transitway$

∃contains.LandArea



- $\exists \text{contains.Transitway}$ (2)
- \exists contains.SelfConnectedObject (3)
 - \exists contains.Roadway (4)
 - \exists contains.Road (5)

$\exists {\rm contains.LandTransitway}$	(6)
$\exists contains.LandArea$	(7)
$\exists contains. Building$	(8)
$\forall contains. \neg Floor$	(9)
$\forall \text{contains.} \neg \text{Ceiling}$	(10)

DaSe Lab



Positive (selection):





STATE

WRIGHT

Negative (selection):

DaSe Lab



 $\exists contains.(DurableGood \sqcap \neg ForestProduct)$

Positive:







WRIGHT STATE

$\forall \text{contains.}(\neg \text{Furniture} \sqcap \neg \text{IndustrialSupply})$

Positive (selection):





Negative (selection):

DaSe Lab







 $\exists contains. SentientAgent$



Positive:

Negative (selection):





OaSe Lab





$\exists contains. Body Of Water$







- Utilize more sophisticated ontology.
- Utilize more sophisticated mappings.
- Explain hidden neurons.

• Tune DL-Learner better to the specific task.



Collaborators Derek Doran and Ning Xie (Web and Complex Systems Lab)

They explore how to determine groups of hidden neurons which often fire together and thus may indicate the "detection" of certain features.

We plan to apply the above mentioned DL-Learner approach also to these groups of hidden neurons, in order to determine which features they detect.





Thanks!



- Pascal Hitzler, Frank van Harmelen, A reasonable Semantic Weg Semantic Web 1 (1-2), 39-44, 2010.
- Prateek Jain, Pascal Hitzler, Peter Z. Yeh, Kunal Verma, Amit P. Sheth, Linked Data is Merely More Data. In: Dan Brickley, Vinay K. Chaudhri, Harry Halpin, Deborah McGuinness: Linked Data Meets Artificial Intelligence. Technical Report SS-10-07, AAAI Press, Menlo Park, California, 2010, pp. 82-86. ISBN 978-1-57735-461-1. Proceedings of LinkedAI at the AAAI Spring Symposium, March 2010.
- Pascal Hitzler, Krzysztof Janowicz, *What's Wrong with Linked Data?* http://blog.semantic-web.at/2012/08/09/whats-wrong-with-linked-data/, August 2012.
- Pascal Hitzler, Markus Krötzsch, Sebastian Rudolph, Foundations of Semantic Web Technologies. Chapman and Hall/CRC Press, 2010.



- Pascal Hitzler, Krzysztof Janowicz, Linked Data, Big Data, and the 4th Paradigm. Semantic Web 4 (3), 2013, 233-235.
- Krzysztof Janowicz, Pascal Hitzler, The Digital Earth as Knowledge Engine. Semantic Web 3 (3), 213-221, 2012.
- Krzysztof Janowicz, Pascal Hitzler, Thoughts on the Complex Relation Between Linked Data, Semantic Annotations, and Ontologies. In: Paul N. Bennett, Evgeniy Gabrilovich, Jaap Kamps, Jussi Karlgren (eds.), Proceedings of the 6th International Workshop on Exploiting Semantic Annotation in Information Retrieval, ESAIR 2013, ACM, San Francisco, 2013, pp. 41-44.
- Krzysztof Janowicz, Frank van Harmelen, James A. Hendler, Pascal Hitzler, Why the Data Train Needs Semantic Rails. Al Magazine 26 (1), 2015, 5-14.



- Michelle Cheatham, Pascal Hitzler, String Similarity Metrics for Ontology Alignment. In: H. Alani, L. Kagal, A. Fokoue, P. Groth, C. Biemann, J.X. Parreira, L. Aroyo, N. Noy, C. Welty, K. Janowicz (eds.), The Semantic Web - ISWC 2013. 12th International Semantic Web Conference, Sydney, NSW, Australia, October 21-25, 2013, Proceedings, Part II. Lecture Notes in Computer Science Vol. 8219, Springer, Heidelberg, 2013, pp. 294-309.
- Michelle Cheatham, Pascal Hitzler, The Properties of Property Alignment. In: Proceedings OM-2014, The Ninth International Workshop on Ontology Matching, at the 13th International Semantic Web Conference, ISWC 2014, Riva del Garda, Trentino, Italy, October 2014. To appear.



- Maryam Labaf, Pascal Hitzler, Anthony B. Evans, Propositional Rule Extraction from Neural Networks under Background Knowledge. In: Proceedings of the Twelfth International Workshop on Neural-Symbolic Learning and Reasoning, NeSy'17, London, UK, July 2017.
- Md. Kamruzzaman Sarker, Ning Xie, Derek Doran, Michael Raymer, Pascal Hitzler, Explaining Trained Neural Networks with Semantic Web Technologies: First Steps. In: Proceedings of the Twelfth International Workshop on Neural-Symbolic Learning and Reasoning, NeSy'17, London, UK, July 2017.



- S. Bader and P. Hitzler, Dimensions of neural-symbolic integration

 a structured survey. In: S. Artemov et al. (eds). We Will Show
 Them: Essays in Honour of Dov Gabbay, Volume 1. College
 Publications, London, 2005, pp. 167-194.
- B. Hammer, P. Hitzler (eds.). Perspectives of Neural-Symbolic Integration. Studies in Computational Intelligence, Vol. 77. Springer, 2007, ISBN 978-3-540-73952-1.
- Denny Vrandečić, Markus Krötzsch. Wikidata: A Free Collaborative Knowledgebase. In Communications of the ACM 57:10. ACM 2014.



- Artur d'Avila Garcez, Tarek R. Besold, Luc de Raedt, Peter Fölukk, Pascal Hitzler, Thomas Icard, Kai-Uwe Kühnberger, Luis C. Lams, Risto Miikkulainen, Daniel L. Silver, Neural-Symbolic Learning and Reasoning: Contributions and Challenges. In: Andrew McCallum, Evgeniy Gabrilovich, Ramanathan Guha, Kevin Murphy (eds.), Proceedings of the AAAI 2015 Spring Symposium on Knowledge Representation and Reasoning: Integrating Symbolic and Neural Approaches. Technical Rport SS-15-03, AAAI Press, Palo Alto, 2015.
- Jens Lehmann, Pascal Hitzler, Concept Learning in Description Logics Using Refinement Operators. Machine Learning 78 (1-2), 203-250, 2010.
- Ramanathan V. Guha, Dan Brickley, Steve Macbeth: Schema.org: Evolution of Structured Data on the Web. ACM Queue 13(9): 10 (2015)



- Wouter Beek, Laurens Rietveld, Stefan Schlobach, Frank van Harmelen, LOD Laundromat: Why the Semantic Web Needs Centralization (Even If We Don't Like It). IEEE Internet Computing 20(2): 78-81 (2016)
- Adila Krisnadhi, Nazifa Karima, Pascal Hitzler, Reihaneh Amini, Michelle Cheatham, Víctor Rodríguez-Doncel, Krzysztof Janowicz, Ontology Design Patterns for Linked Data Publishing. In: Pascal Hitzler, Aldo Gangemi, Krzysztof Janowicz, Adila Krisnadhi, Valentina Presutti (eds.), Ontology Engineering with Ontology Design Patterns: Foundations and Applications. Studies on the Semantic Web Vol. 25, IOS Press/AKA Verlag, pp. 201-232.

